

PAID VOLUNTEERS – INVESTIGATING RETENTION OF ARMY RESERVISTS

by

Jodie Karla Lording

Master of Education (Adult Education) – University of Technology Sydney

Bachelor of Music (Education) – University of Sydney (Conservatorium of Music, Sydney)

THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF
THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE AWARD OF

DOCTOR OF EDUCATION

In the
Faculty
of
Arts and Social Science

UNIVERSITY OF TECHNOLOGY SYDNEY

2013

All rights Reserved. This work may not be
reproduced in whole or in part, by photocopy
or other means, without prior written permission given by the author.

Certificate of Authorship/Originality

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and in the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Ethics approval for this work is current and granted by the University of Technology (UTS HREC 2005-046A)

A handwritten signature in purple ink, appearing to read 'Jodie Lording', with a stylized, elongated loop at the end.

JODIE LORDING

Abstract

The Australian Government is using many of its Department of Defence capabilities in operations abroad and at home. To achieve this, the Australian Defence Force (ADF) has increasingly relied on the capability of the Reserve Forces; in particular the Army Reserve (ARes). While demand for Reservists has increased, the overall force numbers have been decreasing. This creates problems not only in Defence capability but also in the quality of training, morale and attendance. Defence has conducted many surveys of serving Reservists to understand their motivations from a qualitative standpoint. It is the aim of this descriptive empirical phenomenological research, through the lived experience of the participants, to complement that work by understanding the experiences and perspectives of those experiencing military service in two part-time army organisations (Australia and the United Kingdom's Territorial Army (TA)) in order to better inform Human Resource (HR) policy and practice within the Australian Army Reserve.

A descriptive empirical phenomenological study was undertaken to understand the lived experiences of Reservists and Territorial Army members. Nine participants reflected on their motivations to join, their experiences of recruitment, training, and promotion, and some of their most enjoyable and least enjoyable aspects of Reserve service. A human resources (HR) lens was used to focus the literature and research data approaches. The data was analysed using a descriptive empirical phenomenological method. As a result, both the participant and researcher voice is presented. This is then referenced against the data, models and theories presented in the literature to identify consistencies and points of difference between past research and this approach. This study suggests that the psyche of Reservist motivation is unique by being a combination of both volunteer and part-time employee motivation.

The conclusions drawn identify that most of the participant Reservists experienced service through both a volunteer perspective (value for time) and through an employee perspective (value for money); this in turn influences Reservists' retention. HR practice in the Army focuses on the employee motivation of Reservists. As a result, developing

HR policies and practices that considers the volunteer motivations of Reservists as well may enhance retention. The richness of the phenomenological results points to a worthwhile methodological strategy for future Reserve service research.

Dedication

In loving memory of my father, Dennis Allan Strong (1950–2010).

Dad, your drive, dedication to family and pursuit of perfection continue to live on through those who knew and loved you. As does ‘our’ personal father/daughter saying: ‘How hard could it be?’ ... some things are achievable!

Acknowledgements

Many people have generously given their time to assist me in writing this work.

I am heartily thankful to my supervisor, Dr Tony Holland, whose encouragement, guidance and support from the initial to the final stages enabled me to develop my research abilities, question my questions and understand the topic. His interest, availability and friendly encouragement was vitally important to me in writing this thesis. Thank you for many insightful chats and coffees over many years.

I owe a debt to the participants of the study whose patience with a student researcher and willingness to wholly participate has provided the depth and breadth of data that one can only hope for on embarking on this form of research.

The eagle eye of my colleague and friend, Bill Cowham, has provided endless frustration for me in the proofreading phase of the project. This is only due to his boundless enthusiasm for perfection in written work. His eagerness to challenge me and test the meaning of my written word has ensured that the product matches my interest and passion for the subject. My thesis, due to his guidance and inquisitiveness, is all the better for his efforts and support.

My husband Rob has always been supporting in the background. His patience, guidance, love and support have no boundary and my thanks to him for the encouragement in undertaking this lengthy but enjoyable task cannot be expressed in words. Robyn Strong, my mother, has had many challenges of her own during this journey including losing her husband (my Dad) of 40 years, Dennis, to Motor Neuron Disease three years ago. Mum has always believed that this thesis would see fruition and encouraged me to keep going, even in the toughest hours.

Lastly, I offer my regards and blessings to the many others who have supported me in any respect during the completion of this project.

Many thanks!

Jodie Lording

Disclaimer

This research has captured the lived experiences and perceptions of Reservists at a particular point in time, against a backdrop of policy, process and procedure that has subsequently changed since data gathering. Whilst all efforts have been made to present the data against the backdrop of the policy at the time, the findings of the research may have become more or less relevant due to changes in the Department of Defence's thinking. In any case, this research gives the participating Reservists a voice. Their experience is likely to be different to other Reservists (including my own), Regular members and ex-serving members and other readers of this work.

My own view of Defence and Reserve service is generally positive. I have my own experiences as a Reservist that has resulted in a long, enjoyable and continuing Reserve career. I have served both as a Reservist with a civilian career and studies underway, and I have also served for five years of full-time Reserve service. I have been deployed on multiple occasions and had the honour of leading Australian men and women on operations and at home.

My greatest concern is that the reader will perceive that this research is an unnecessarily critical review of Defence approaches to Reservists and that this reflects my own opinion of Defence policy when viewed through the Human Resource lens. This is not the case. I am not personally disappointed with Defence's approach to Reserve policy and am, as a whole, satisfied with the direction in which the Defence Force is heading, and of which the Reserve is a part.

That aside, improvement also comes from deep reflection, and this thesis attempts to provide a mirror of reflection on areas for improvement in a part of the organisation that is not generally well understood. This thesis represents a small number of Reserve voices highlighting what is known to them, what has been experienced by them and what Reserve service means or meant to them.

Table of Contents

Chapter 1 – Introduction	1
1.1 The Seed for the Study	1
1.2 Research Topic and Question.....	3
1.3 Reserve, Territorial, Militia or Part-Time Armies	5
1.4 The Australian Army Reserve.....	6
1.5 Relevance of Reserves	9
1.6 Significance of this Research	11
1.7 Structure of the Thesis.....	13
Chapter 2 – Literature Review.....	15
2.1 Literature Review Context	16
2.2 What is Human Resources?.....	18
2.2.1 What does an HR Department Do?	20
2.2.2 HR, Defence and the Australian Army.....	21
2.3 Motivation Theory.....	24
2.3.1 Maslow’s Hierarchy of Needs Theory.....	24
2.3.2 ERG Theory of Motivation.....	26
2.3.3 Herzberg’s Two Factor Motivation and Hygiene Theory	27
2.3.4 Bandura’s Self-Efficacy	28
2.3.5 Vroom’s Expectancy Theory.....	29
2.3.6 Discussion on Motivation Theory and the Military.....	29
2.4 Employee Categories.....	31
2.4.1 Full-time Employees.....	32
2.4.2 Part-time Employees.....	32
2.4.3 Volunteers.....	33
2.4.4 Casualisation.....	34
2.5 Attitudes, Motivation and Differences in Employee Categories.....	35
2.5.1 Attitude Differences between Full-time and Part-time Employees.....	36
2.5.2 Attitude Differences between Paid Employees and Volunteers	39
2.5.3 Psychological Contracts	43
2.5.4 Current ARes Survey Data	46
2.5.5 Work-life Balance.....	52
2.5.6 Organisational Culture and the Military	54
2.5.7 Reserve Identity	57
2.6 HR Practice and Reserve Soldiering	58
2.6.1 Remuneration.....	59
2.7 Retention	67
2.7.1 Survey Research into Military Retention	69
2.7.2 Economic-Based Theory and Military Retention.....	69
2.7.3 Individual Process Models and Military Retention	72
2.8 Gaps and Tensions in the Literature.....	72
2.8.1 Reserve Research.....	73
2.8.2 Reservists are Part-time Employees or Casuals?.....	76
2.8.3 Unique Nature of Reserve Service	78

Chapter 3 – Methodology.....	81
3.1 Research Tradition	82
3.2 The Role of the Researcher	87
3.3 Method	89
3.3.1 Step 1 – Define the Research Question	90
3.3.2 Step 2 – Conduct a Pre-study	91
3.3.3 Step 3 – Choose a Theory and Use it as a Scheme of Reference	92
3.3.4 Step 4 – Interview Preparation and Conduct	94
3.3.5 Step 5 – Study First-order Constructs	102
3.3.6 Step 6 – Construct Second-order Constructs	104
3.3.7 Check for Unintended Effects	106
3.3.8 Relate the Evidence to the Literature and the Field of Study	107
Chapter 4 – Phenomenological Data and Interpretation.....	109
4.1 Psyche of the Part-time Soldier – Volunteer or Paid Employee	113
4.1.1 Part-Time Employment	114
4.1.2 Volunteer	115
4.1.3 Bit of Both – the Paid Volunteer	116
4.1.4 Review of Employee or Volunteer Perception	119
4.2 Part-time Soldiering Culture, Identity and Motivation	121
4.2.1 <i>Esprit de Corps</i> for the Unit or Regiment	121
4.2.2 Engagement	123
4.2.3 Set Apart – Volunteer vs. Employee vs. Civilian	125
4.2.4 Changing Culture	127
4.2.5 Review of Culture, Identity and Motivation	131
4.3 Experiencing Defence Policy	134
4.3.1 The Role and Relevance of the Reserve	135
4.3.2 Deploying the Reserve <i>En Masse</i>	137
4.3.3 Policy Makers who do not Understand Reserve Life	138
4.3.4 Restructuring	139
4.3.5 Review of Policy Effects on Part-Time Soldiering	141
4.4 Experiencing the Tensions of Work/Life Balance	143
4.4.1 Time	144
4.4.2 Civilian Career	146
4.4.3 Family	147
4.4.4 Review of the Impact of Work/Life Balance in Reserve Construct	149
4.5 Motivations to Join and Experiencing Recruitment	151
4.5.1 Motivations to Join	151
4.5.2 Experiencing Recruitment	153
4.5.3 Review of Motivations to Join and Experiencing Recruitment	158
4.6 Experiencing Satisfaction from Reserve Service	162
4.6.1 Satisfaction from Deploying	163
4.6.2 Experiencing Courses, Training, and Learning	164
4.6.3 Sharing Camaraderie	166
4.6.4 Experiencing Exercises	166
4.6.5 Experiencing Adventure Training	167
4.6.6 The Responsibility	168
4.6.7 Participating in Live Firing/Live Fire Demonstrations	168

4.6.8	Review of Experiencing Satisfaction in the Reserves	169
4.7	Experiencing Dissatisfaction from Reserve Service	173
4.7.1	Experiencing Dissatisfaction from Training.....	173
4.7.2	Experiencing Bureaucracy and Administration.....	181
4.7.3	Experiencing Remuneration and Benefits	185
4.7.4	Lack of Recognition	190
4.7.5	Perceptions of Commitment and Expectations Placed on the Reserves.....	193
4.7.6	Experiencing Full-time Soldiers' Attitudes towards Part-timers.....	194
4.7.7	Being 'Stuffed Around'	194
4.7.8	Review of Dissatisfaction of Reserve Service.....	195
4.8	Review of Satisfaction and Dissatisfaction of Reserve Service.....	202
4.9	Staying and Leaving the Reserves	204
4.9.1	Serving Members Thoughts on Leaving the ARes.....	205
4.9.2	Ex-Serving Members' Reasons for Leaving	208
4.9.3	Review of Staying and Leaving the Reserves	211
4.10	Lived Experiences, Perceptions and Reserve Service.....	212
Chapter 5 – Discussion		215
5.1	How Do Reservists Experience and View their Reserve Work?	218
5.1.1	Paid Volunteers.....	218
5.1.2	Reservist Lived Experience Lifecycle	220
5.1.3	Reserve Motivation.....	222
5.2	How does Defence HR Policy and Practice Impact the Lived Experience of Reservists?	223
5.2.1	The Casual Reservist and Ambiguity	223
5.2.2	HR and Reserve Service	226
5.2.3	Reservists Experiencing Change	230
5.3	How do Reservists Experience Resignation and their Decision to Stay or Leave?.....	230
5.3.1	Not Value for Money, but Value for Time	231
Chapter 6 – Implications and Recommendations.....		235
6.1	Recognise and Accept Reserve Motivation Differs from Other Employee Motivations to Work	236
6.2	Develop a Soft Human Resource Management Philosophy in which HR Frameworks are Developed with Reservists at the Centre of the Construct	237
6.3	Leverage Reservists 'Other Life' Experiences in the Creation and Implementation of Human Resource Philosophies, Policies, Programs, Practices and Processes	238
6.4	Implications	239
6.5	Limitations of the Study	240
6.6	Further Research	242
6.6.1	Phenomenological Research in the Military Reserves	242
6.6.2	Psychological Fields.....	243
6.6.3	Human Resource Fields.....	244
6.7	Concluding Remarks	245

List of Figures

Figure 1: Literature Review Context.....	17
Figure 2: Maslow's Hierarchy of Needs (Simons, Irwin & Drinnien 1987)	25
Figure 3: Alderfer's Frustration-Regression Principle (Alderfer 1972)	26
Figure 4: Part-Time Employment Growth in Australia (Australian Bureau of Statistics 2010)	49
Figure 5: Part-Time Employee Comparison against Total Workforce in Australia (Australian Bureau of Statistics 2010).....	49
Figure 6: Analysis of ARes Numbers over Time (Lording)	50
Figure 7: Kinnunen, Feldt, Geurts and Fulkkinen's Four-Factor Spillover Model (Lavassani & Movahedi 2007, p. 6)	54
Figure 8: Kinnunen, Feldt, Geurts and Fulkkinen's Four-Factor Spillover Model – Extended to include Reserve Service (Lording)	80
Figure 9: Diagram Layering Context with HR Construct.....	94
Figure 10: Lifecycle and Context Impact on Worker Psyches	221
Figure 11: Kinnunen, Feldt, Geurts and Fulkkinen's Four-Factor Spillover Model (Lavassani & Movahedi 2007), Extended to Include Reserve Service and the Perceived Impact on Time	231

List of Tables

Table 1: Table of Participants in Interviews	110
Table 2: ARes Experience with Timeframe for Enlistment.....	154
Table 3: Comparing Reserve motivation with employee and volunteer motivation	172